

Centrum judaistických studií Kurta a Ursuly Schubertových
Posudek magisterské diplomové práce

Název práce: Hnutí Šabtaje Cvi na Moravě v raném novověku

Autor: Miroslav Dyrčík

Konzultant: Tamás Visi, MA, Ph.D.

Téma:	5%	1
Metodologie a argumentace:	20%	2
Interpretace:	20%	1,5
Použití sekundární literatury:	10%	2
Struktura a forma:	30%	2
Bibliografický aparát:	15%	1,5
Celková známka před obhajobou:		1,775

Miroslav Dyrčík chose an important but rather neglected topic of Moravian Jewish history. Researching of the life of the Sabbatean prophet (or charlatan or however you wish to call him) Leibele Prostitz is a much more difficult enterprise than topics that are usually chosen by MA students at Palacky University. None of the relevant sources are available in English (not to say Czech) translation and most of them are not available in modern critical editions. Mr. Dyrčík received substantial help from our colleague, Dr. Marie Krappmann, who provided him with a working translation of a Yiddish source. Dr. Krappmann's help is duly credited in the thesis. However, most of the sources Mr. Dyrčík had to access in eighteenth-century Hebrew prints or manuscripts – sometimes in poor quality copies of the original texts.

Mr. Dyrčík managed to read and understand these texts and succeeded in identifying some contradictions between them. He succeeded in formulating some plausible hypotheses concerning the actual events that took place in Leibele's life and about the sources' attitudes toward Leibele and the ways these attitudes are reflected in them. In all these discussions Mr. Dyrčík clearly distinguishes primary source materials from ideas and information taken from secondary literature. He carefully distinguishes facts from interpretations and hypotheses. This must be appreciated even if some of the actual interpretations and hypotheses are not very convincing.

Mr. Dyrčík attempts to insert the story of Leibele Prostitz into a more general context of Moravian Jewish history. This is a most praiseworthy aspect of his work. However, there are other contexts which are relevant for understanding the sources and the events related in them. Jacob Emden, and his pursuit for heretics is an obvious context of interpreting his narrative of Leibele Prostitz. There were few anti-Shabbatean heresy hunters among eighteenth-century European rabbis and their activities has been recently analyzed by Elisheva Carlebach ("The Pursuit of Heresy", 1990), Alexander Putik (in *Judaica Bohemiae*, 2006), David Ruderman ("Early Modern Jewry," 2010) and others. Unfortunately, the results of these scholars are

ignored in the thesis, although they concern a question of fundamental importance: how far Emden's stories can be believed in general? The suggestion that Leibele suffered from epilepsy is interesting but would need more considerations of historical (and not medical) type: how epilepsy was perceived and described by eighteenth-century medical writers? Was there any difference between Jewish and Christian medical literature concerning epilepsy?

Despite these shortcomings there no doubt that Mr. Dyrčák's work should be accepted as an MA thesis at Palacky University, perhaps with the second best degree.

Podpis konzultanta: Tamás Visi, MA, Ph.D.