

## MASTER THESIS REVIEW

**Author:** Yunia Nursita Sari  
**Thesis:** Sustainable City Indicator: a case study of Bishkek  
**Reviewer:** Jiri Preis

### Content

*Please comment on: aims, structure, methods; depth and quality of analysis.*

*Originally it was planned to compare two cities from two different macro-regions: central Asia (Bishkek) and ASEAN (Jakarta). Due to Covid-19, lockdowns and limited access to data, the content had to be modified and "squeezed" only to the city of Bishkek.*

*Aims are defined well, and methodological approaches are adequate. Unfortunately, insights of local stakeholders giving their opinion on urban sustainable development indicators as well as strategy are missing. Author argues, that Covid-19 pandemic and lockdown limited her to gather primary data, but perhaps online discussions or interviews could have been made and thus to gather important data from local stakeholders.*

*The analysis of documents is adequate. Author is using state indicators first, which are considered to be "too macro", and thus less suitable for implementation into creating sustainable development strategy of the city. Her effort to create something more suitable for Bishkek is the main content of the thesis.*

*Final synthesis makes sense, the division into three rigid groups (social/economic/environmental) is questionable: some indicators could belong to more than one group (e.g. sustainable business and tourism to environmental; green behaviour could also belong to environmental; rural/urban integration could belong to social; etc).*

*Finally, author provides some practical "policy proposals". I am missing some discussion, how much these proposals are possible to really apply. I can understand, that limited (or almost none) opportunity to discuss the results of the analysis with local stakeholders hinders a process of transforming theoretical synthesis into more practical "cookery book" for local politicians, otherwise there is a threat, that these ideas remained only on a paper.*

### Literature and references

*Please comment on: literature used and references.*

*Literature and references are adequate, however global bestsellers dealing with this topic (e.g. J. Sachs 2015: The Age of Sustainable Development; J. Blewitt 2015: Understanding Sustainable Development) are missing and their thoughts implemented in the thesis could have made the literature analysis more insightful.*

## Formal requirements

*Please comment on: language style, consistency, graphic layout, tables and figures etc.*

*Geographical figure on p. 33 is not correct from the cartography point of view.*

*Sometimes missing word(s) or words are connected together (no space between them).*

*Tables and graphic styles are ok, language is adequate and is understandable.*

*Tables sometimes across three pages (better form would be more appropriate; perhaps A3 page, better layout and the structure of the chart which aspires to be one of the most important synthetic results of the thesis)*

## Topics for discussion

*Mention questions that may be discussed during the defense. Delete the whole section if you do not have any questions.*

- 1) What other sources of data have you planned to gather, if no lockdown and social distancing did not limit you? (see chapter. 1.6, p. 3). How that could change the possible results and outcomes of your thesis?*
- 2) How do you view the fact, that some indicators in New set of key indicators (pp. 48-50) could belong to more than one group. Do you have any idea how to make the set more inter-connected?*
- 3) Is there any interest from the city hall of Bishkek to at least consider to use your analysis and apply in taking practical steps of sustainable development strategy in Bishkek?*

## Overall evaluation and proposed grade

*Please comment on your overall evaluation of the thesis. This section should end with a separate sentence (if you do not recommend the thesis for defense, add "not" in the sentence; then the proposed grade must be F):*

*I do recommend the thesis for defense. I propose the grade: B.*

**Date:** 17<sup>th</sup> June, 2020

**Signature:**

